

Dave Rado

From: "James J. McCarthy" <jmccarthy@oeb.harvard.edu>
To: "Dave Rado" <dave.rado@dsl.pipex.com>
Sent: 18 May 2007 03:42
Subject: Reiter and IPCC - very curious

Hi Dave,

I spoke with both Richard Moss (WG II, Head of Technical Support Unit Second and beginning of Third Assessments) and Neil Leary (WG II, Head of Technical Support Unit Third Assessment).

With both phone and email messages I have attempted to reach (unsuccessful so far) Jonathan Patz (author of papers that have taken a different position from Reiter's papers on incidence of highland malaria, and author on WG II human health chapters).

Richard and Neil are confident that nothing like what Reiter describes with regard to having "resigned", asking that his name be removed from the chapter author list, or threatening legal action ever happened on their watches at WG II. Moreover, Reiter's remark "this happened a great deal...specialists...don't agree and resign...there have been a number that I know of..." is completely without basis in fact. Neither Richard, Neil, nor I can recall a single instance in our experiences with SAR and TAR WG II of even one author having "resigned" or having asked that his name be removed from the author list.

I have to read a chapter of our upcoming Northeast States Climate Impact Assessment (just arrived) yet this evening, so I probably won't be able to get to the text I promised until the flight on Saturday.

Regards, Jim

--

James J. McCarthy
MCZ
26 Oxford St.
Cambridge, MA 02138
617-495-2330 tel
617-496-4079 fax

Dave Rado

From: "James J. McCarthy" <jmccarth@oeb.harvard.edu>
To: "Dave Rado" <dave.rado@dsl.pipex.com>
Cc: "Tony McMichael" <Tony.McMichael@anu.edu.au>; "Jonathan Patz" <patz@wisc.edu>; <nleary@agu.org>; "Sari Kovats" <Sari.Kovats@lshtm.ac.uk>
Sent: 20 May 2007 14:50
Subject: More on Reiter and IPCC

Dear Dave,

I reached Jonathan Patz by phone on Friday. As you may recall, he was a Lead Author on Chap 9, Human Health, WG II, TAR. I read to him the transcript with Reiter's comments about resigning from the IPCC, threats of legal action, etc. Jonathan, like Neil Leary and I, has no recollection of such an incident involving Reiter or any other author.

However, Jonathan did recall that Reiter attended one of the author meetings, having been asked to do so by Duane Gubler (a Lead Author) who was unable to attend this particular meeting. This is noteworthy in that it would have been a departure, an unusual departure, from the policy that the author meetings were for the approved authors only.

While we were on the phone Jonathan was able to recover the draft of Chapter 9 at the conclusion of the September 2000 Lead Author meeting in Lisbon (perhaps the one Reiter attended), and it has Reiter's name listed as a Contributing Author. Whoever was responsible for preparing the up-to-date draft at the conclusion of the meeting apparently made this addition to the Contributing Author list. Unlike Lead Authors, Contributing Authors did not have oversight responsibilities for the chapter and did not attend the Lead Author meetings. Typically they were asked to contribute small sections of text by correspondence. The published version of Chapter 9 lists ten Lead Authors (two of them served as Coordinating Lead Authors - McMichael and Githecko) and six Contributing Authors.

I have seen Tony's email (and that forwarded from Sari Kovats - also a Lead Author on Chapter 9). Just how Reiter's name came to be on the Lisbon document and just how it was removed is unclear. But as Kovats points out, Reiter seems to have exaggerated his claim of having been the equivalent of an author. If he "threatened legal action" it must have been a dramatic boast buoyed by hot air. It seems highly unlikely that McMichales, Kovats, Patz, Leary, and McCarthy would not have known of this if it had happened as Reiter claims. Moreover, it would have been such an unusual event (none of us recall anything like this with any author) that all five of us could not have simply forgotten it.

Regards, Jim

Dave Rado

From: "James J. McCarthy" <jmccarth@oeb.harvard.edu>
To: David Dokken <ddokken@usgcrp.gov>
cc: Neil Leary <nleary@agu.org>; <jmccarth@oeb.harvard.edu>;
 Dave Rado <dave.rado@dsl.pipex.com>
Sent: 22 May 2007 07:23
Subject: Re: Fwd: Re: More on Reiter and IPCC

Dear Dave,

You do indeed keep good records!

Thanks for your help with this. I am in OR at the moment and heading for CA. After I return home on the weekend I will send some background information.

As always, it is a delight to be working with you,

Jim

-----Included Message-----

Date: 21-May-2007 16:15:29 -0400

From: "David Dokken" <ddokken@usgcrp.gov>

To: "Neil Leary" <nleary@agu.org>, "David Dokken" <ddokken@usgcrp.gov>

Cc: <jmccarth@oeb.harvard.edu>

Subject: Re: Fwd: Re: More on Reiter and IPCC

Dear Neil and Jim -

Here's what I can reconstruct. I cannot say for certain if Reiter went to Lisbon in place of Gubler, because I had to cancel at the last moment (Tina came down with pneumonia). So, no Dokken visual record....

Further, I cannot trace via the IPCC non-Fed travel pot audit trail because Gubler was a Fed at the time (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention) so no travel voucher via UCAR. I know for certain that I did not approve travel for Reiter no matter what his affiliation. No record in my copious TA files.

He's not listed in the WG2 TAR Annex B (on off chance a dual citizen like Filippo Giorgi/WG1). And there also is no record for Reiter in the 2002 IPCC WG2 database, which means that he didn't even get entered as an Expert Reviewer much less as an author. He could have been a Contributing Author because that info was not necessarily entered in the database if no one ever bothered to tell Sandy. Anybody could be a CA and it took no blessing from the Bureau, TSU, or anyone. CLAs just add/delete from the author lists.

I continued by checking my chron files in the following categories/mail directories:

Lisbon LAM
 TAR Chap-9
 Secretariat Interactions

Keyword search yields nothing. Checked the last one just in case we asked the Secretariat to allow a non-LA to an LAM. Nope.

Last thing to check were the Chapter 9 drafts. I'll paste in the author lists at the end. OK, looks like he dropped between the GRev and FGD. The FGD list was not altered and that's what's in the published volume.

Since he appears to have been involved earlier than you indicated, I checked my Geneva LAM (1st) and Canberra LAM (2nd) chron files. Nothing.

So, giving this complete paucity of data from myriad sources, any claims that he resigned in protest can be regarded as pure HooHah. He would have had no more substantive input than a paragraph or figure, and I know he didn't give the latter cuz would have had to work through me.

dave

P.S. That was fun. I keep great records.

EXPERT REVIEW

Coordinating Lead Authors
 Anthony McMichael (UK), Andrew Githeko (Kenya)

Lead Authors
 Rais Akhtar (India), Rodolfo Carcavallo (Argentina), Duane Gubler (USA), Andy Haines (UK), Pim Martens (The Netherlands), Jon Patz (USA), Akhiko Sasaki (Japan)

Contributing Authors
 Kris Ebi (USA), Dana Focks (USA), Larry Kalkstein (USA), Sari Kovats (UK), Elisabet Lindgren (Sweden), Steve Lindsay (UK), Paul Reiter (USA)

Review Editors
 Ulisses Confalonieri (Brazil) and Alistair Woodward (New Zealand)

GOVERNMENT REVIEW

Coordinating Lead Authors
 Anthony McMichael (UK), Andrew Githeko (Kenya)

Lead Authors

Rais Akhtar (India), Rodolfo Carcavallo (Argentina), Duane Gubler (USA), Andrew Haines (UK),
R Sari Kovats (UK), Pim Martens (The Netherlands), Jonathan Patz (USA), Akihiko Sasaki (Japan)

Contributing Authors

Kristie L Ebi (USA), Dana Focks (USA), Laurence Kalkstein (USA), Elisabet Lindgren (Sweden), Steven Lindsay (UK), Paul Reiter (USA)

Review Editors

Ulisses Confalonieri (Brazil) and Alistair Woodward (New Zealand)

FINAL GOVERNMENT DISTRIBUTION

Coordinating Lead Authors

Anthony McMichael (UK) and Andrew Githeko (Kenya)

Lead Authors

R. Akhtar (India), R. Carcavallo (Argentina), D. Gubler (USA), A. Haines (UK), R.S. Kovats (UK), P. Martens (The Netherlands), J. Patz (USA), A. Sasaki (Japan)

Contributing Authors

K.L Ebi (USA), D. Focks (USA), L. Kalkstein (USA), E. Lindgren (Sweden), S. Lindsay (UK), R. Sturrock (UK)

Review Editors

U. Confalonieri (Brazil) and A. Woodward (New Zealand)

Dave Dokken

U.S. Global Change Research Program
Climate Change Science Program
1717 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Suite 250
Washington, DC 20006
USA
+1.202.419.3473 (direct voice)
+1.202.223.3065 (fax)

-----Included Message-----

At 9:03 AM -0400 5/21/07, Neil Leary wrote:
Hi Dave,

Hope all is well with you.

I have some questions for you about ancient history of the TAR. Paul Reiter has made some assertions about having been an author for WG2, resigning and asking to have his name removed as one of the authors -- even threatening legal action if his name was not removed. He also claims to have attended a lead author meeting.

If you still have lists of persons who attended the lead author meetings for TAR WG2, could you check to see if Reiter attended any? Jonathan Patz thinks that Reiter might have attended the Lisbon meeting, possibly coming in place of Duane Gubler who could not attend. But he's not sure.

Could you also check to see if Reiter was ever listed as a lead author on any of the drafts of the health chapter? Jonathan says Reiter was listed as a contributing author on post-Lisbon draft, but was subsequently removed. But Jonathan has no memory of Reiter ever being a lead author, or threatening legal action to have his name removed from the chapter.

If you have any memory of any disagreements, or legal threats, regarding Reiter's participation in the TAR, could you share them with Jim and me?

Thanks
Neil

Neil Leary, PhD
The International START Secretariat
2000 Florida Avenue NW, Suite 200
Washington, DC 20009 USA
Phone: 1 202 462 2213
Fax: 1 202 457 5859
Email: nleary@agu.org
Website: www.start.org; www.aiaccproject.org

-----Included Message-----

Date: Sun, 20 May 2007 20:13:12 -0400
From: JONATHAN A PATZ <patz@wisc.edu>
Subject: Re: More on Reiter and IPCC
To: jmccarthy@oeb.harvard.edu
Cc: Dave Rado <dave.rado@dsl.pipex.com>, Tony McMichael <Tony.McMichael@anu.edu.au>, nleary@agu.org, Sari Kovats <Sari.Kovats@lshtm.ac.uk>

Jim,
While I can say for sure that his name did

appear as Contributing Author on the near final draft, please verify with Tony whether or not he attended (physical) one of the lead author meetings. I could be mistaken -- recall I couldn't remember where or when. i defer to Sari or Tony's memory regarding attendance; i've seen Reiter at other venues, so again i now not sure about attendance (especially after your comment that it would be unusual).

jonathan

Jonathan Patz, MD, MPH
Associate Professor and Director, Global Environmental Health
Center for Sustainability and the Global Environment (SAGE)
Nelson Institute for Environmental Studies &
Dept. Population Health Sciences
University of Wisconsin, Madison
1710 University Avenue
Madison, WI 53726

608.265.9119
608.265.4113 (fax)
patz@wisc.edu
www.sage.wisc.edu (web)

Adjunct Associate Professor, Dept. Environmental Health Sciences
Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health